SYSTEM ANALYSIS OF BRAIN DRAIN PROGRAM IN BALOCHISTAN

Zafar Ulllah and Anwaar Mohyuddin

Department of Anthropology, Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad
Zafarullah.buitms@gmail.com, unwaar@gmail.com

ABSTRACT : The aim of the present study is to investigate the leading factors behind the brain drain in Balochistan. This study will not only give groundbreaking facts to the readers but also will provide the other researchers with new dimensions to look into this matter. The nature of the study is exploratory because the researcher explored the basic facts about the phenomenon of brain drain in Balochistan. For the proposed study, the researcher selected five respondents from a diversified set of professionals using purposive sampling technique. Qualitative anthropological techniques were used for data collection. Brain drain in Balochistan is caused by dominating factors of unrest caused by sectarianism, militancy, and kidnap for ransom and poor working conditions inside the organization. Other independent variables like family consideration and better living standard, income, better opportunities, career growth, and political instability were termed as valid reasons by the respondents as shown in the literature but, in this research the respondents did not term these factors as dominating factors of brain drain. This situation has been analyzed in light of world system theory.

INTRODUCTION

The history of brain drain is traced back to the era of Greek philosophers with the technocrats who moved their services across geographical borders. The tendency of highly skilled professionals towards migration, in search of a better job, good living standard, and sound economic backup is still continuing even in the 21 century. Most often brain drain is perceived as an economic phenomenon to find out the solution of which only demands only remunerations and technological equipment. On the contrary, it is thought to be a complex intellectual, gender, social and intercontinental concept [1]. The expression brain drain was first coined by the British Royal Society. They indicated the outflow of scientists and technologists to the United States and Canada in the 1950s and early 1960s often known as the net flow of expertise in one direction [2].

In fact, everybody is in search of better opportunity. If the opportunities are not compatible with those of their intellectual and professional skills, they surely think for a better option to fulfill their desired expectations. Thus, they shift to a place where all their expectations are met. And the doors of all countries are open for the exceptional minds all the time in order to develop and rule economically, technologically, culturally and politically.

The metaphor 'brain' pertains to any skill, competency, or personal attribute that may be considered a marketable organizational asset, while 'drain' refers to a substantial exit of such talent from the workforce [3]. Brian drain is defined as "The emigration of highly trained or qualified people from country" [4].

Brain Drain as per the definitions shows that it is a phenomenon due to which the highly skilled and educated professionals, out of any reason to leave their native areas. One such issue the research has noticed that the professionals like doctors, professors, engineers, journalists, and so on have continually left Balochistan province. According to a report twenty five senior PhDs have transferred to other parts of the country from the university of Balochistan and two hundred teachers have submitted applications for transfer [5]. Journalists in huge numbers have switched to other parts of the country following the terrible incident in which at least

twenty two journalists were killed in the last four years and approximately twenty nine doctors and professors have left Balochistan due to this unrest as their lives were not safe [5]. In this age of competition and globalization as it is argued that human capital is one of the vital assets for any form of organization. Therefore, the research shows that for the survival of any organization internal variation and bright human capital is necessary [6,7]. Another research pointed out the causes of Brain Drain in terms of crisis and decline in organizations. According to their study the professional may think to switch over to other opportunities because of downsizing [8-11].

The causes of brain drain may vary in terms of time and space as shown in the previous study. The professionals and the skilled people always prefer to have a better earning which could fulfill all their needs. Therefore, when the income is not sufficient for their needs, they possibly switch to countries which meet their expectation for a better living. Okediji and Okediji [12] found in their research that income is one of the important factors for emigration of professionals.

Besides better living and good income, there may be a number of other determinants of Brain Drain. According to the study of Oteiza [13] political instability could be a major cause of Brain Drain, the countries where political freedom is scarce they may face this issue. Similarly the research of Kidd [14] blamed countries who encourage the immigration by providing facilities to highly educated people to capture them. Nabil et al [15] carried out a study based on two cohorts of medical graduates in Lebanon. These cohorts are similar to each other, except for the civil war disturbance. First cohort includes graduates of 1960 through 1969 which was the era without civil war, whereas the other cohort included graduates from the same university with the same qualification, but at a point in time when the civil war was continued in Lebanon. In this study they found out a significant number of physicians migrated from the country due to civil war disturbance.

Better job opportunities may result in a reverse brain drain like during the 1970s and 1980s India was troubled because of losing its educated workforce to the west, particularly to

the United States through brain drain. However, the new growth and employment opportunities, particularly in Bangalore and Hyderabad (emerged as India's leading tech cities) which became a pulling factor for the expatriates (well-educated and rich first generation) in order to take advantage of new job opportunities and to strengthen their connections with their heritage [16].

The Heavy outflow of qualified workers, in fact affects the sending country both socially and economically [17]. Pakistani students after receiving professional training prefer to stay in the USA to work. This he terms as brain drain and says, it is a loss of the country which needs their skills and experience the most. The research tried to find out the reason behind the attitude if they would return to Pakistan. He concluded that most of the professional were enjoying a better standard of living than in the USA so the economy is not the only factor for the majority except some of them. There are several other factors which stops them returning back to Pakistan, like treatment of religious minorities in Pakistan, unaware of the procedure to find employment on their return, impediments to satisfactory professional activities and having no friendly and helpful contact, and frequent communication and supply of information by the Government and the Embassy [18].

LOCALE

Balochistan is situated on the western part of Pakistan. It shares its international border with Iran, and southern provinces of Afghanistan. The largest among the whole five provinces of Pakistan, Balochistan, occupies 43 percent of the total land measuring 796,000 square kilometers. Balochistan is home to different ethnic groups (Baloch, Pakhtoon, Punjabi, Hazara and Sindhi and Urdu speakers and others), religious minorities, including Hindus, Sikhs, Parsees (Zoroastrians), and a population divided on the basis of the sect, including Sunni and Shia [19].

Balcohistan is comprised of thirty districts. There are total "11000 primary schools, 800 middle schools, 400 high schools, 73 colleges and 5 universities in Balochistan province. The literacy rate is 26.6% with the ratio of 36.5% male and 15.0% female respectively" [20].

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The nature of the study is exploratory because the researcher wants to unearth the basic facts about the phenomenon of the Brain Drain in Balochistan .For the proposed study the Researcher selected five respondents belonging to a diversified set of professions like, professors, doctors, journalists, lecturers. Purposive sampling technique was used for the selection of the respondents. Respondents were selected after informed consent because it is a very sensitive topic to investigate. In-depth interviews with the help of a brief review of literature were used as a technique of data collection. The researcher has collected the data from primary as well as secondary sources. The primary sources include the in-depth interviews of the respondents and the secondary sources include the official record of the Government of Balochistan and reports from print and electronic media.

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

The theoretical framework for this research paper has been drawn from World Systems Theory developed by Immanuel Wallerstein in the 1970s and 1980s. His three volume work "The modern world system" [21-23], Historical Capitalism [24], "The end of the world as we know it [25] and number of essays [26-36] were the major contribution in developing the theory. The other thinkers of world system theory are Samir Amin [37, 38], Cardoso and Falleto [39], Dos Santos [40, 41], Rodney [42], and Andre Gunder Frank [43]. According to them the reason for underdevelopment of peripheral countries in the world economy is not the lack of economic and human resources, it is due to an unequal relationship between them and the core regions. As long as this unequal exchange of goods prevails between the core and peripheral countries the periphery is likely to stay underdeveloped. Keeping the peripheral countries underdeveloped helps the authoritative core countries to extract labour from these underdeveloped countries through their brain drain programs and use it in their own benefit causing harmful effects in their native countries. These brain drain programs support the process of capital accumulation in the core regions, rather than serving the interests of their own populations. In this article an attempt would be made to explore the application of world systems analysis to the brain drain program of the core countries.. The interactions between global economic, forces of production and local contexts would also be taken into account.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Brain Drain is a universal phenomenon. Its impact has been analyzed by different researchers in one or another form as stated above. The huge outflow of people belonging to the diversified profession from Balochsitan particularly during the last decade made me curious to look into the matter and unearth the underlying facts which is causing brain drain. This phenomenon is novel in the sense that in Balochistan, it had never been investigated. After reviewing the literature and variables set independently by the researchers the relationship of the following independent variables is examined.

Unrest

Unrest due to sectarianism, militancy, and kidnap for ransom is one of the strongest push factors that compelled the respondents to leave Balochistan. "Life has become hell (respondents in a very sad mood). Our lives are not safe; we were in the state of worry all the time because all our kids were not safe when they would go to school. We were uncertain about our life because the professors, teachers, doctors were killed and abducted". Another respondent said "bomb explosion had become the part of our daily life. Public places were not safe, therefore we were just restricted to our workplace and home; we could not go to bazaar for shopping, for entertainment in the parks" majority of the respondent left because of the problem of kidnap for ransom. . According to a report [5] twenty five senior PhDs have transferred to other parts of the country from the university of Balochistan and two hundred teachers have submitted applications for transfer. Journalists in a huge number have switched to other

parts of the country following the terrible incident in which at least twenty two journalists were killed in the last four years and approximately twenty nine doctors and professors have left Balochistan due to this unrest as their lives were not safe. Nabil et al [15] carried out a study based on two cohorts of medical graduates in Lebanon finds that civil war disturbances became the factor of brain drain among the physician.

Poor Working Conditions

Poor working conditions inside an organization is one of the push factors to switch. The respondents in majority were complaining about the unfavorable environment inside the organizations. "The behavior of the administrative staff is so irritating that it became one of the factors to switch (so hopeless)" said one of the respondents. Lack of facilities, unfavorable behaviors of the administrative staff became one of the factors. As Orton [18] in his research on Pakistani students after receiving professional training prefer to stay in the USA to work finds the impediments to satisfactory professional activities and having no friendly and helpful contact, and frequent communication and supply of information by the Government and the Embassy. The respondents were also afraid that poor working conditions may result collapse of the organization so they did not feel secure as one of the respondents said " we need sound footing for the future of our family therefore we prefer a well established organization". According to their study Becker, Greengard, Merry, and Mone [8-11] the professional may think to switch over to other opportunities because of downsizing.

Family Consideration and Better Living Standard

The natives are much concerned about the families; better living standard, quality schooling of their kids, peaceful environment. They said that for the better future of their children they have shifted because they cannot risk the future of their children while living in Balochistan. This shows that the married couples are more inclined to switch because they are more concerned for the good living standard of their family.

Career Growth

The carrier is one of the several factors of brain drain. "We have come here for our career growth; to excel in research work and for exposure" Said one of the respondents. Career growth as per the respondents was an important factor to switch; Majority of the respondents showed positive gesture when they were asked if career growth mattered for them. The opportunities for career growth in term of studies and professional career, according to them were not available in their native therefore they all consider it an important factor to switch.

Better Facilities

The developed countries have been offering fascination opportunities to the educated people in order to use their skills and knowledge for the sake of their development. This influx of highly skilled people to the other region is of course a loss to the country or specific area which they belong to. The research of Kidd [14] blamed countries who encourage the immigration by providing facilities to highly educated people to capture them. Kidd's argument, in fact, shows that

better opportunities are deliberately made available for the people so that they use their potential for their gains. The respondents showed their will and agreed that better opportunity is one of the least dominant factors that pulled them toward the organization in which they are serving now

Better Income Opportunity

One of our respondents said, "Good income fascinates everyone for enjoying a comfortable life." But the organization they were serving in, had a salary which was sufficient for their needs. In this case the respondents showed a mild response that income were not the pulling factor to switch to other provinces. This research contradicts the findings of Okediji and Okediji [12] that income is one of the important factors for emigration of professionals. Orton [18] concluded in response to his research "the attitude if they would return to Pakistan". He concluded that most of the professional were enjoying a better standard of living than in the USA so the economy is not the only factor for the majority except some of them.

Political Instability

The natives were not satisfied with the policies of government. All the respondents expressed their resentment on the unproductive policies taken particularly in the previous government. They said that the political leaders are unqualified and the policies they make are affecting the social institutions which in turn compel the well educated people to leave because according to the respondents their voice should be heard as they belong to the educated class. According to the study of Oteiza [13] political instability could be a major cause of Brain Drain, the countries where political freedom is scarce they may face this issue. However, some of the respondent did not take the Government policies a cause of brain drain.

THEORETICAL DISCOURSE

Thomas S. Popkewitz from Department of Curriculum & Instruction, University of Wisconsin Madison, USA while addressing during the National Curriculum conference of the USAID Teacher Education Project (Pre-STEP) held in Islamabad, said, "We do not invest much on education in our country. We do not even motivate our youth to get professional education in specific fields or even to complete their basic education up to graduate level because we can attract skilled human resource from the third world at lower rates. We have the resources and can provide them what they cannot get in their own countries" [44]. So keeping the peripheral countries at status quo helps the core countries in their brain drain program.

Core countries are providing financial assistance mostly through NGOs to the periphery so that they could get skilled labour at cheaper rates and to keep the labour rates low they do not provide any real chance for economic growth to these countries as the development of capitalism in core countries requires a continuous and conscious underdevelopment of peripheral countries for regular supply of raw materials and cheap labour. They just keep them revolving in a vicious circle which starts from poverty leads to the dependency on core countries from where they get low wage rates which ultimately increases poverty.

In the end the researcher is in full agreement with the concept of world system theory where the theorists like Immanuel Wallerstein, Samir Amin, Cardoso, Falleto, Santos, Rodney, and Andre Gunder Frank [21-43] have pointed out the intervention of core regions in the different sector of the peripheral countries through financial assistance to the NGOs and pressurizing the Governments in certain cases just to extract labour from these underdeveloped countries through their brain drain programmes and use it in their own benefit. In the light of empirical data world system theory is found valid and accepted.

CONCLUSION

Brain Drain in Balochistan is a novel topic which has not yet been brought into consideration by the academic researchers. During the last decade the number of professionals migrating from Balochistan is huge which made me (the researcher) curious to pin down the reasons of Brain drain. There is no exact number of professionals yet recorded who have left Balochistan except some figure stated above given by the print media.

The research findings show that unrest caused by sectarianism, militancy and kidnap for ransom became one of the biggest reasons which pushed the professional to migrate. Poor working conditions inside organization also became one of the factors that lead the professionals to switch. This justifies that poor working conditions push educated people to switch. Other variables like family consideration and better living standard, income, better opportunities, career growth, and political instability were termed as valid reasons by the respondents as well as shown in the literature but, in this research the respondents did not term these factors as dominating factors of brain drain.

After exploring the underlying facts of brain drain in Balochistan, this research further opens doors for new researchers like a male brain drain vs. females drain and the reasons that why only males in huge number migrate.

RECOMMENDATIONS

- Government should devise proper strategies in order to maintain law and order situation.
- The policies should be long term, effective and public-friendly.
- The culprits should be brought into justice, not for the sake of revenge, but to ask them those reasons which compelled them to be deviant.
- The institutions should work properly under the umbrella of the state so that a peaceful and integrated society attracts the professionals who by then could contribute in the development of society at lager.
- Public as well as private sectors should make their environment attractive, productive, efficient and conducive so that the professionals feel comfortable at their workplace.
- The intellectual brains should be taken into account to add value, particularly in terms of development.

REFERENCES:

[1] Ansah, E.E. (2002). Theorizing the Brain Drain. *African Issues* Vol. 30, No. 1, 21-24

[2] Sajjad, N. (2011). Causes and Solutions to Intellectual Brain Drain in Pakistan. *The Dialouge Volume VI Number 1.*

[3] *Rosenblatt, Z. & Sheaffer, Z. (2001). Brain drain in declining organizations: toward a research agenda.* Journal of Organizational Behavior: Volume 22, Issue 4. *409–424*

[4] Oxford Dictionaries. April 2010. Oxford University Press. http://oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/brain drain (accessed December 14, 2012).

[5] Dawn. (2010, 05, 30). *Dawn.com*. Retrieved from Dawn: http://dawn.com/news/880837/murder-of-teachers-in-balochistan

[6] Campbell. D.T. 1969. Variations in selective retention in socio-cultural evolution. General Systems 14: 69-85.

[7] Stinchcombe A L. 1965. Social structure and organizations: In Handbook of Organizations. March S G. (ed.). Rand McNally: Chicago

[8] Becker, G. 1974. The Economic Approach to Human Behavior Schooling Experience and Earning: National Bureau of Economic Research and Columbia University Press, New York

[9] Greengard, S. 1998. Don't rush downsizing: plan, plan, plan. Personnel Journal Nov: 64-75.

[10] Merry, U. & Brown, G.I. 1986. The Neurotic Behavior of Organizations. Gardner Press: New York

[11] Mone, M. A. 1994. Relationships between self-concepts, aspirations, emotional responses, and intent to leave a downsizing organization. Human Resource Management 33: 281-298.

[12] Okediji, O. & Okediji, F. O. (1973) "Consideration of some Factors Influencing the Loss of Nigerian Medical Personnel to Developed Nations." West African Journal of Education 17, 1 (February).

[13] Oteiza, E. (1967). La Emigration de Personal A Itamente Calificado de la Argentina: Un Caso de "Brain Drain" Latinoamericano. Buenos Aires: Economic Research Center, Instituto Tor-cuato di Telia.

[14] Kidd, C. V. (1967). Migration of Health Personnel, Scientists, and Engineers from Latin America. Washington D.C.: Pan American Health Organization Scientific Publication #142.

[15] Nabil, M. & Kronfol, A. M. (1992). The Impact of Civil Disturbances on the Migration of Physicians: The Case of Lebanon. *Medical Care, Vol. 30, No. 3* , 208-215.

[16] Chacko, E. (2007). From brain drain to brain gain: reverse migration to Bangalore and Hyderabad, India's. *GeoJournal Vol. 68, No. 2/3, Immigrants and Transnational Experiences in World*, 131-140.

[17] Giannoccolo, P. (2004). The Brain Drain: A Survey of the Literature. *Journal of Statistics Working Series University of Bolonga Paper series*.

[18] Orton, J. W. (1982). Brain Drain of Pakistani Professional in the United States. *Pakistan economic and soical review*, 30-35.

[19] Yusufzai, R. U. (n.d.). Retrieved from The tragedy of Balochistan's minorities: www.criticalppp.com/archives/43726

[20] PDMA. (2012, April 11). *Balcogistan profile*. Retrieved from PDMA Balochistan : http://www.pdma.gob.pk/?p=39#

[21] Wallerstein, I. (1974). *The Modern World System, vol. I: Capitalist agriculture and the origins of the European world economy in the sixteenth century*. New Research Journal of Social and Life Sciences, ISSN 0973-3914, Vol.-13-II, Year-07, Dec.-2012 211 York: Academic Press.

[22] Wallerstein, I. (1980). *The Modern World System II: Mercantilism and the Consolidation of the European World Economy.* 1600-1750. New York: Academic Press.

[23] Wallerstein, I. (1989). *The modern world system, vol. III: The second great expansion of the capitalist world economy 1730-1840s*. San Diego: Academic Press.

[24] Wallerstein, I. (1996). *Historical Capitalism with Capitalist Civilization.* USA: W.W. Norton & Company.

[25] Wallerstein, I. (1999).*The End of the World as We Know It: Social Science for the Twenty-First Century.* USA: University of Minnesota Press.

[26] Wallerstein, I. (1974). The Rise and Future Demise of the World Capitalist System:Concepts for Comparative Analysis. *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, *Vol. 16, No. 4,* 387-415.

[27] Wallerstein, I. (1979). *The Capitalist World Economy*. New York: Cambridge University Press.

[28] Wallerstein, I. (1983). Nationalism and the World Transition to Socialism: Is There a Crisis? *Third World Quarterly*, *Vol. 5, No. 1,* 95-102.

[29] Wallerstein, I. (1991). Beyond Annales.*Radical History Review*, *No. 49,* 14.

[30] Wallerstein, I. (1991). *Geopolitics and Geo-culture: Essays on the Changing World System*. New York: Cambridge University Press.

[31] Wallerstein, I. (1995). What Are We Bounding, and Whom, When We Bound Social Research?.*Social Research62(4)*, 839-856.

[32] Wallerstein, I. (1997). *The Rise and Future Demise of World Systems Analysis*. Paper delivered at the 91st annual meeting of the American Sociological Association, New York.

[33] Wallerstein, I. (2000). *The Development of an Intellectual Position.Adapted version of the introductory essay to the essential Wallerstein*. New York: New Press.

[34] Wallerstein, I. (2003). *The Decline of American Power*. New York: New Press.

[35] Wallerstein, I. (2004). *The Uncertainties of Knowledge*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.

[36] Wallerstein, I. (2004). World-Systems Analysis, in World System History.In G.Modelski(Ed.),*Encyclopedia of Life Support Systems(EOLSS),* UNESCO. Oxford:Eolss Publishers.

[37] Amin, S. (1970). *L'accumulation à l'échellemondiale; critique de la théorie du sous- développement.* Dakar: IFAN.

[38] Amin, S. (1973). *Neo-colonialism in West Africa*.Hamondsworth, UK: Penguin.

[39] Cardoso, F. H. & Falletto, E. (1969). *Dependenciaydesarollo en América Latina*. Mexico City: SigloVentiuno.

[40] Dos Santos, T. (1970a). *Dependenciaeconómicaycambiorevolucionario*. Caracas: Nueva Izquierda.

[41] Dos Santos, T. (1970b). The Structure of Dependency. *American Economic Review*, *60(2)*, 231-236.

[42] Rodney, W. (1974). *How Europe Underdeveloped Africa*. Washington, DC: Howard University Press.

[43] Frank, G. (1969). *Capitalism and Underdevelopment in Latin America*. New York: Monthly Review Press. 212 Research Journal of Social and Life Sciences, ISSN 0973-3914, Vol.-13-II, Year-07, Dec.-2012

[44] Popkewitz, T. S. (2012). Lecture in National Curriculum Conference of USAID Teacher Education Project (Pre-STEP), Islamabad.